

|          |   | Appellant LVIA       |   |                 |   | Dorset CC Proof          |                            |                        |  | Appellant Proof   |  |                                     |   |   |
|----------|---|----------------------|---|-----------------|---|--------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------|--|---|--|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| Receptor | Relevant ES VPs                                     | susceptibility value | sensitivity magnitude                                       | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement  | susceptibility value     | sensitivity magnitude      | level of effect        | narrative explaining judgement   | Relevant VPs in JM Proof  | susceptibility value                         | sensitivity magnitude               | level of effect   | narrative explaining judgement  |
| 1        | <b>Weymouth and Portland Residential Areas</b>      | 4, 5 (8,9,10)        | High<br>High<br>High<br>Negligible                          | Slight          | Very minor alterations to the composition of views within the context of port facilities over a negligible proportion of the overall views. The ERF is likely to be viewed obliquely from a very small number of residential areas and streets and the proposals will not be central to the focus of views  | Not stated<br>Not stated | High<br>medium             | moderate - substantial | Minimal narrative. No discussion of nature of change   | VP 9 [Figure JM5 / JM6]<br><br>VP10<br><br>VP24 [Figures JM25 / JM26]<br><br>VP25 [Figures JM27 / JM28]   | high<br>high<br>high<br>high                 | high<br>high<br>high<br>high        | small - med<br>small - med<br>small - med<br>small - med  | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing<br><br>ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing<br><br>ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing<br><br>ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Similar scale and form to naval ship seen in Figure. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |
| 2        | <b>SW Coast Path</b>                                | 6,7,8,9,10,14        | High<br>High<br>High<br>Small - Negligible                  | Slight          | Overall, the ERF is expected to cause a minor alteration to a small proportion of the field of views and the experience of walkers using the SWCP is expected to remain substantially unchanged. Geographical extent of visibility limited.   | Not stated<br>Not stated | high<br>medium             | substantial            | Minimal narrative. No discussion of nature of change. Says 'seriously underestimated' but does not explain why.                            | VP9<br>VP10<br>VP25<br>VP24<br><br>VP23 [Figures JM23 / JM24]<br><br>VP21 [Figures JM19 / JM20]<br><br>VP20 [Figures JM17 / JM18]<br><br>VP19 [Figures JM15 / JM16] | as above<br>as above<br>as above<br>as above | high<br>high<br>high<br>small - med | small - med<br>moderate<br>moderate<br>neg to minor   | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing<br><br>ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing<br><br>The view includes a variety of built forms within the harbour and along the harbour edge including the marina and National Sailing Academy. The Proposed Development would be difficult to pick out due to the presence of multiple similar vertical elements.<br><br>The stack of the ERF would be visible beyond utilitarian harbour buildings in the middle ground of the view. The rest of the Appeal Proposal would be screened by intervening buildings       |
| 3        | <b>S. Dorset Ridgeway and Osmington White Horse</b> | 11                   | High<br>High<br>High<br>Negligible                          | Negligible      | V. minor alteration to the composition of distant views, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view. Portland cliffs form backdrop. Viewed in context of port facilities and shipping.   | Not stated<br>Not stated | high<br>small - negligible | slight                 | No explanation of nature of change   |   |  |                                     |   | not assessed  |
| 4        | <b>Weymouth Beachfront</b>                          | 6                    | High to Medium<br>High to Medium<br>High to Medium<br>Small | Slight          | A minor alteration to the composition of views. Visual effects localised. No views from Esplanade as Nothe peninsula screens  | Not stated<br>Not stated | High to Medium<br>Small    | moderate to slight     | No narrative other than to quibble with application of matrix  |   |  |                                     |   | not assessed  |
| 5        | <b>Portland Port and Breakwaters</b>                | 3                    | Medium<br>Medium<br>Medium<br>Medium                        | Moderate        | ERF viewed in context of an industrial port with large scale buildings and shipping as well as cranes, masts, lighting columns, radar equipment and funnels on the naval vessels. Also viewed in context of large blocks of flats at Ocean views and former naval accommodation block. Visible from a large number of locations on the water and adjacent port area, with glimpses from marina. Views within port are private (no public access). | Not stated<br>Not stated | Medium<br>Medium           | Moderate               | No narrative - agrees with LVIA  | VP19 [Figures JM15 / JM16]  | medium<br>high<br>medium - high<br>v small   | minor                               | The stack of the ERF would be visible beyond utilitarian harbour buildings in the middle ground of the view. The rest of the Appeal Proposal would be screened by intervening buildings |   |
| 6        | <b>Footpaths and Bridleways south of Littlemoor</b> | 13                   | Medium<br>Medium<br>Medium<br>Small                         | Slight          | Views from local footpaths judged to be medium sensitivity in accordance with Figure 9.4 in LVIA. The ERF will have a very minor alterations to the composition of the views and the building and stack will not break the skyline.   | Not stated<br>Not stated | High/Medium<br>Small       | moderate to slight     | Disagrees with LVIA treatment of local footpaths (despite accepting and using the ES LVIA methodology). Otherwise no narrative explanation |   |  |                                     |   | not assessed  |

|          |                                   | Appellant LVIA       |                |                |                 | Dorset CC Proof                |                      |  |            | Appellant Proof |                                |                          |                         |  |                            |                 |                                |               |                |           |   |
|----------|-----------------------------------|----------------------|----------------|----------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|--|----------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|---------------|----------------|-----------|---|
| Receptor | Relevant ES VPs                   | susceptibility value | sensitivity    | magnitude      | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement | susceptibility value | sensitivity  | magnitude  | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement | Relevant VPs in JM Proof | susceptibility value    | sensitivity  | magnitude                  | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement |               |                |           |   |
| 7        | Ringstead Bay NT Carpark and PRow | 12                   | high           | high           | high            | negligible                     | slight               | ERF will cause a very minor alteration to the composition of these distant views, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view, and will be viewed with the Portland cliffs forming a backdrop. It will not break the skyline and the profile of the Isle of Portland will remain unchanged.  | Not stated | Not stated      | high                           | negligible to small      | slight                  | No narrative - disagrees with assessment of magnitude but doesn't explain why.   | not assessed               |                 |                                |               |                |           |   |
| 8        | Portland PRowS                    | 1,2                  | Medium         | Medium         | Medium          | Medium                         | Moderate             | The ERF would be visible from a number of locations along the PRow, particularly s3/81. Partial alteration to composition and nature of views but seen in context of port infrastructure. Many potential views screened by scrub vegetation  | Not stated | Not stated      | medium to high                 | medium                   | moderate                | Disagrees with LVIA treatment of local footpaths (despite accepting and using the ES LVIA methodology). Accepts that there are detractors.                   | VP15 [Figures JM7 / JM8]   | medium - high   | medium                         | medium - high | no change      | no effect | Fully screened by topography and vegetation   |
|          |                                   |                      |                |                |                 |                                |                      |  |            |                 |                                |                          |                         |  | VP16                       | high            | high                           | high          | small - medium | moderate  | A clearly visible addition to the foreground of a broad and complex view. Seen in context with other port infrastructure. Below eyeline and thus would not impinge on coastal panorama              |
|          |                                   |                      |                |                |                 |                                |                      |  |            |                 |                                |                          |                         |  | VP17                       | high            | high                           | high          | medium         | moderate  | Stack clearly visible. Minor component of view but in absence of other visible industrial elements would locally alter perception   |
|          |                                   |                      |                |                |                 |                                |                      |  |            |                 |                                |                          |                         |  | VP18                       | high            | high                           | high          | small - medium | moderate  | Stack partially visible as background element in context of strongly defined foreground. Port infrastructure is visible to north. Underlying nature of view remains materially the same.            |
| 9        | A354                              | 8                    | low            | low            | low             | negligible                     | negligible           | The proposed ERF will create very minor alterations to the composition of views through the introduction of elements that are of little prominence over a negligible proportion of the field of view.  | Not stated | Not stated      | "higher"                       | high to medium           | moderate to substantial | Elevates sensitivity for cyclists and pedestrians. States that the magnitude of change will be greater than for Sandsfoot Castle but doesn't explain further | VP23 [Figures JM23 / JM24] | high            | high                           | high          | small - med    | moderate  | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |
|          |                                   |                      |                |                |                 |                                |                      |  |            |                 |                                |                          |                         |  | VP21 [Figures JM19/ JM20]  | high            | high                           | high          | small - med    | moderate  | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |
| 10       | A353                              | n/a                  | low            | low            | low             | negligible                     | negligible           | The ERF will cause a very minor alteration to the composition of these distant views, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view, and will be transitory in nature, as the road has a 40 mph speed limit and is winding in nature, meaning that receptors will be concentrating on driving.   | Not stated | Not stated      | medium                         | negligible               | negligible to slight    | Indicates that assessment requires a photograph (it does not).   | not assessed               |                 |                                |               |                |           |   |
| 11       | B3155                             | 6                    | medium         | medium         | medium          | negligible                     | negligible           |  | not stated | not stated      | medium                         | negligible               | negligible              | No narrative. Agrees with LVIA   | not assessed               |                 |                                |               |                |           |   |
| 12       | Sandsfoot Castle, Park and Garden | 9                    | high to medium | high to medium | high to medium  | medium                         | moderate             | The building will form a new visible element to the port and will alter the horizon; however, it is a similar height to the largest ships that berth at the port and does not detract from the height of the Isle of Portland and The Verne, which tower above it. The visual effects at completion will be localised, with views possible across Portland Harbour towards the working port and ship berths  | high       | high            | high                           | medium                   | substantial             | Sensitivity elevated to high due to heritage value and views across harbour. No discussion of the nature of the view or how it would change.                 | VP 9 [Figure JM5 / JM6]    | high            | high                           | high          | small - med    | moderate  | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |
| 13       | Nothe Fort                        | 10                   | high to medium | high to medium | high to medium  | small                          | slight to moderate   | The ERF will create very minor alterations to the composition of the view, with the development visible in the context of Portland Port, with a steep cliff backdrop. The visual effects at completion will be localised, with the ERF visible from a small number of locations within the gardens.  | high       | high            | high                           | small                    | moderate                | Sensitivity elevated to high due to heritage value and views across harbour. No discussion of the nature of the view or how it would change.                 | VP10                       | high            | high                           | high          | small - med    | moderate  | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |
| 14       | Dorset AONB                       | 7,11,12,14           | high           | high           | high            | negligible                     | slight               | The ERF will cause a very minor alteration to the composition of these distant views from the AONB, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view, and will be viewed with the Portland cliffs forming a backdrop. It will not break the skyline from honey pots such as Durdle Door, Ringstead Bay and White Horse Hill and the profile of the Isle of Portland will remain unchanged. The tranquility, remoteness and undeveloped rural character of the AONB will be retained, as the ERF will be viewed in the context of Osprey Quay and the large port facilities, with its large naval vessels and other shipping | Not stated | Not stated      | high                           | slight to negligible     | slight                  | No narrative. Increases magnitude of change but doesn't say anything about the nature of the view or how it would change                                     | not assessed               |                 |                                |               |                |           |   |

|          |                         | Appellant LVIA |       |             |           | Dorset CC Proof |                                |  |            | Appellant Proof |           |                 |                                |   |          |   |
|----------|-------------------------|----------------|-------|-------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------------------|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------------------|---|----------|---|
| Receptor | Relevant ES VPs         | susceptibility | value | sensitivity | magnitude | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement | susceptibility   | value      | sensitivity     | magnitude | level of effect | narrative explaining judgement |   |          |   |
| 15       | W Dorset Heritage Coast | 7,11,12,14     | high  | high        | high      | negligible      | slight                         | The ERF will cause a very minor alteration to the composition of these distant views from the heritage coast, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view. It will be viewed in the context of the large port facilities, with its large naval vessels and other shipping.   | Not stated | Not stated      | high      | small - medium  | moderate                       | Explains that views from Chesil Beach are only a relatively short distance from the site. No discussion of nature of change |          |   |
| 16       | UNESCO WHS              | 1,5,7,14       | high  | high        | high      | negligible      | slight                         | The ERF will cause a very minor alteration to the composition of these distant views from the WHS, altering a negligible proportion of the field of view. It will be viewed in the context of the large port facilities, with its large naval vessels and other shipping, and will have a very minor effect on the functional or experiential setting of the WHS. The visual effects at completion will be localised, with the ERF visible from a number of locations along the Jurassic Coastline, including areas between Weymouth and east beyond the 10 km study area. There will be closer views along the Chesil spit between Weymouth and Portland and parts of the South West Coast Path. The ERF will not be central to the focus of views. | Not stated | Not stated      | high      | small - medium  | moderate                       | Explains that views from Chesil Beach are only a relatively short distance from the site. No discussion of nature of change |          |   |
|          |                         |                | high  | high        | high      | small - med     | moderate                       | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing  |            |                 | high      | high            | high                           | small - med   | moderate | ERF would occupy a small segment of a broad and complex view. Subordinate to Portland. Smaller than cruise ships. Underlying nature and composition of view remains materially the same as existing |

Not Significant Significant